

ARIF HYDER ALI

Contact Information Redacted

10 June 2017

VIA E-MAIL

Chris Disspain
Chair, ICANN Board Governance
Committee
12025 Waterfront Drive, Suite 300
Los Angeles, CA 90094

Jeffrey A. LeVee, Esq.
Jones Day
555 South Flower Street
Los Angeles, CA 90071 2300

Re: ICANN's 2 June 2017 Community Priority Evaluation Process Review Update

Dear Messrs. Disspain and LeVee:

We write on behalf of our clients, DotMusic Limited (“DotMusic”) and dotgay LLC (“dotgay”), regarding ICANN’s 2 June 2017 Community Priority Evaluation Process Review Update (“CPE Process Review Update”).

Our review of ICANN’s CPE Process Review Update confirms that ICANN is in violation of its commitments to operate transparently and fairly under its bylaws.¹ As you are aware, after the ICANN Board announced in September 2016 that it is conducting “an *independent review* of the process by which ICANN staff interacted with the community priority evaluation provider, both generally and specifically with respect to the CPE reports issued by the CPE provider,”² we sent multiple requests to ICANN seeking, among others, the disclosure of the identity of the organization conducting the independent review, the organization’s remit, the information it had been provided,

¹ See e.g., Art. III, Section 3.1, ICANN Bylaws, effective 11 February 2016 (“ICANN and its constituent bodies shall operate to the maximum extent feasible in an open and transparent manner and consistent with procedures designed to ensure fairness”); Art. I, Section 2 (8) (“Make decisions by applying documented policies neutrally and objectively, with integrity and fairness”).

² Resolution of the ICANN Board, 17 Sept. 2016 (emphasis added).

whether the evaluator will seek to consult with the affected parties, etc.³ In fact, at one of the sessions during the ICANN GDD Madrid Summit Meeting, Constantine Roussos, the Founder of DotMusic, directly asked the ICANN CEO, Staff and Chair of the BGC Chris Disspain to disclose the name of the independent investigator retained by ICANN to review the CPE Process. However, no one from ICANN disclosed any information about the independent investigator.⁴ At the same GDD Madrid Summit Meeting, DotMusic also made the same inquiry with the ICANN Ombudsman Herb Waye. The ICANN Ombudsman stated that ICANN also did not disclose the name of the independent investigator to him, despite DotMusic's formal complaint with the Ombudsman that, *inter alia*, requested such information to be disclosed in a transparent and timely manner. ICANN continued to operate under a veil of secrecy; even Mr. Disspain's 28 April 2017 letter and Mr. LeVee's 15 May 2017 letter, failed to provide any meaningful information in response to our requests.

It was only on 2 June 2017—*after* DotMusic and dotgay filed their requests for documentary information⁵ and *two weeks* before the investigator's final findings are due to ICANN—that ICANN issued the CPE Process Review Update. We now understand that ICANN selected FTI Consulting, Inc. ("FTI") seven months ago in November 2016 to undertake a review of various aspects of the CPE process and that FTI has *already* completed the "first track" of review relating to "gathering information and materials from the ICANN organization, including interview and document collection."⁶

This is troubling for several reasons. *First*, ICANN should have disclosed this information through its CPE Process Review Update back in November 2016, when it first selected FTI. By keeping FTI's identity concealed for several months, ICANN has failed its commitment to transparency: there was no open selection of FTI through the

³ See *e.g.*, Letter from Arif Ali to Goran Marby regarding DotMusic, dated 30 January 2017; Letter from Arif Ali to ICANN regarding DotMusic, dated 28 April 2017; and Letter from Arif Ali to ICANN regarding DotMusic, dated 21 May 2017.

⁴ ICANN Madrid GDD Summit, May 9, 2017.

⁵ See Documentary Disclosure Information Policy (DIDP) Request 20170505-1 by Arif Ali on Behalf of DotMusic Limited.

⁶ 2 June 2017 CPE Process Review Update.

Requests for Proposals process, and the terms of FTI's appointment or the instructions given by ICANN to FTI have not been disclosed to the CPE applicants. There is simply *no reason* why ICANN has failed to disclose this material and relevant information to the CPE applicants. **Second**, FTI has already completed the "first track" of the CPE review process in March 2017 without consulting the CPE applicants. This is surprising given ICANN's prior representations that the FTI will be "digging very deeply" and that "there will be a full look at the community priority evaluation." Specifically, ICANN (i) "instructed the firm that is conducting the investigation to look thoroughly at the involvement of staff with the outside evaluators and outside evaluators' approach to it, and they're digging in *very deeply* and [] trying to understand the complex process of the new gTLD program and the community priority evaluation process," and that (ii) "when the Board Governance Committee and the board's discussions on it occurred, the request was that there be a *full look* at the community priority evaluation, as opposed to just a very limited approach of how staff was involved."⁷

Accordingly, to ensure the integrity of FTI's review, we request that ICANN:

1. Confirm that FTI will review all of the documents submitted by DotMusic and dotgay in the course of their reconsideration requests, including all of the documents listed in Annexes A and B;
2. Identify ICANN employees, officials, executives, board members, agents, etc. who were interviewed by FTI for the purposes of completing its "first track" review;
3. Disclose the details of FTI's selection process, including the Requests for Proposals process, and the terms under which FTI currently operates for ICANN; and
4. Confirm that ICANN will disclose FTI's final report and findings to the CPE applicants, including DotMusic and dotgay, immediately after FTI completes its review.

⁷ ICANN 58 Copenhagen Meeting, Public Forum 2 Transcript, March 16, 2017. http://schr.ws/hosted_files/icann58copenhagen2017/60/I58CPH_Thu16Mar2017-Public%20Forum%20-en.pdf, pp. 10 – 14.

We remain available to speak with FTI and ICANN. We look forward to ICANN's response to our requests by 15 June 2017.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Arif Hyder Ali', with a long horizontal stroke extending to the right.

Arif Hyder Ali
Partner

cc: Krista Papac, ICANN Complaints Officer (krista.papac@icann.org)
Herb Wayne, ICANN Ombudsman (ombudsman@icann.org)

Annex A

DotMusic Limited

Key Documents

	Description
1.	Expert Legal Opinion of Honorary Professor Dr. Jørgen Blomqvist (17 June 2016)
2.	Expert Ethnomusicologist Opinion by Dr. Richard James Burgess (12 September 2016)
3.	Joint Organisation Experts' Opinion, prepared for ICANN, Organized Alliance of Music Communities Representing over 95% of Global Music Consumed, and DotMusic by Dr. Noah Askin and Dr. Joeri Mol (11 October 2016)
4.	Council of Europe, "Applications to ICANN for Community-Based New Generic Top Level Domains (gTLDs): Opportunities and challenges from a human rights perspective" (3 November 2016)

Other Relevant Documents

	Description
1.	Letter from Constantine Roussos to Christine Willet (12 July 2013)
2.	Letter from Christine Willet to Constantine Roussos (14 August 2013)
3.	Letter from Constantine Roussos to Christine Willet (8 October 2013)
4.	Letter from Christine Willet to Constantine Roussos (22 October 2013)

	Description
5.	Reconsideration Request 14-8 (4 March 2014)
6.	Revised Reconsideration Request 14-8 (5 March 2014)
7.	Board Governance Committee Determination on Reconsideration Request 14-8 (22 March 2014)
8.	Reconsideration Request 14-28 (7 June 2014)
9.	Letter from Constantine Roussos to ICANN (13 June 2014)
10.	Board Governance Committee Determination on Reconsideration Request 14-28 (24 June 2014)
11.	Letter from Constantine Roussos to ICANN (1 July 2014)
12.	Letter from Jason Schaeffer to Robin Bew, Steve Crocker, Fadi Chehadé, Akram Atallah, and Christine Willett (19 August 2014)
13.	Letter from Rich Bengloff to ICANN (7 March 2015)
14.	Letter from Constantine Roussos to ICANN and the EIU regarding FIM's Support Letter (31 March 2015)
15.	Letter from Constantine Roussos to ICANN and the EIU regarding ISME's Support Letter (31 March 2015)
16.	Letter from Constantine Roussos to ICANN and the EIU regarding JMI's Support Letter (31 March 2015)
17.	Letter from Danielle M. Aguirre to ICANN and the EIU (14 April 2015)
18.	Letter from John Snyder to ICANN and the EIU (14 April 2015)

	Description
19.	Letter tom ASCAP and BMI to ICANN (24 April 2015)
20.	Letter from Stephen M. Marks to ICANN (12 May 2015)
21.	Letter from Francis Moore to ICANN (18 May 2015)
22.	Letter from Jo Dipple to ICANN (19 May 2015)
23.	Letter from Rakesh Nigam to ICANN and the EIU (21 May 2015)
24.	Letter from Joe Lamond to ICANN and the EIU (30 July 2015)
25.	Letter from Thomas Theune to ICANN and the EIU(5 August 2015)
26.	Letter from Gilles Daigle to Steve Crocker and Fadi Chehadé (6 August 2015)
27.	Letter from Casey Rae to ICANN and the EIU (11 August 2015)
28.	Letter from Constantine Roussos to ICANN and the EIU (12 August 2015)
29.	Letter from Jason Schaeffer to ICANN regarding the CPE Analysis (12 August 2015)
30.	Letter from Jason Schaeffer to ICANN regarding an Opposition Letter (12 August 2015)
31.	Letter from Paul Zamek to ICANN and the EIU (17 August 2015)
32.	Letter from Dr. Florian Drücke and René Houareau to ICANN (18 August 2015)
33.	Letter from Sarah Gardner to ICANN (26 August 2015)
34.	Letter from Paul Zamek to ICANN and the EIU (2 September 2015)

	Description
35.	Letter from Paul Zamek to ICANN and the EIU (16 September 2015)
36.	Letter from Molly Neuman to ICANN (1 October 2015)
37.	Letter from Benoit Machuel to ICANN and the EIU (5 October 2015)
38.	Letter from Alison Wenham to ICANN and the EIU (6 October 2015)
39.	Letter from Jim Mahoney to ICANN (12 October 2015)
40.	Letter from Helen Smith to ICANN (13 October 2015)
41.	Letter from Paul Zamek to ICANN and the EIU (31 October 2015)
42.	Letter from Jason Schaeffer to ICANN (3 November 2015)
43.	Letter from Patrick Charnley to Steve Crocker and Fadi Chehadé (9 November 2015)
44.	Letter from Paul Zamek to ICANN and the EIU (9 November 2015)
45.	Letter from Paul Zamek to ICANN and the EIU (23 November 2015)
46.	Letter from Paul Zamek to ICANN and the EIU (1 December 2015)
47.	Letter from Christine Willet to Constantine Roussos and Paul Zamek (4 December 2015)
48.	Letter from Imogen Heap to ICANN and the EIU (9 December 2015)
49.	Letter from the International Artist Organization to ICANN and the EIU (11 December 2015)

	Description
50.	Letter from Paul Zamek to ICANN and the EIU (11 December 2015)
51.	Letter from Roxanne De Bastion to ICANN and the EIU (15 December 2015)
52.	Letter from Fran Healy to ICANN and the EIU (15 December 2015)
53.	Letter from Katie Melua to ICANN and the EIU (15 December 2015)
54.	Letter from Rumer Shirakbari to ICANN and the EIU (15 December 2015)
55.	Letter from Ed O'Brien to ICANN and the EIU (15 December 2015)
56.	Letter from Hal Ritson to ICANN and the EIU (15 December 2015)
57.	Letter from Imogen Heap to ICANN and the EIU (16 December 2015)
58.	Letter from Constantine Roussos to ICANN and the EIU (16 December 2015)
59.	Letter from Paul Zamek to ICANN and the EIU (22 December 2015)
60.	Letter from Sandie Shaw to ICANN and the EIU (4 January 2016)
61.	Letter from Paul Zamek to ICANN and the EIU (11 January 2016)
62.	Letter from Amanda Palmer to ICANN and the EIU (19 January 2016)
63.	Letter from Paul Zamek to ICANN and the EIU (25 January 2016)
64.	Letter from DotMusic Limited to ICANN and the EIU regarding ICANN Board Governance Committee Determinations & Inconsistent Policies (10 February 2016)

	Description
65.	Community Priority Evaluation Report regarding DotMusic Limited (10 February 2016)
66.	Reconsideration Request 16-5 (24 February 2016)
67.	Letter from Patrick Charnley of IFPI copying ICANN Board Governance Committee regarding .MUSIC Community Priority Evaluation Report Application ID. 1-1115-14110 (24 February 2016)
68.	Letter from International Federation of Phonographic Industry (IFPI) to ICANN (24 February 2016)
69.	Letter From DotMusic Limited to ICANN Board Governance Committee regarding Reconsideration Request 16-5: ICANN Board and NGPC Policy Resolutions set precedent for BGC (17 March 2016)
70.	Letter from DotMusic Limited to ICANN BGC Chair Chris Disspain, ICANN BGC and ICANN Board regarding Response to .MUSIC LLC's ("Far Further") Letter; International Law and Conventions (28 March 2016)
71.	Letter from National Music Council to Messrs. Chehadé, Crocker, and Disspain regarding ICANN decision to reject DotMusic's application (28 March 2016)
72.	Letter from Jena L. Hoffman to ICANN and the EIU (5 May 2016)
73.	DotMusic Documentary Information Disclosure Policy Request (29 April 2016)
74.	"Applications to ICANN for Community-Based New Generic Top Level Domains (gTLDs): Opportunities and challenges from a human rights perspective" Council of Europe report DGI(2016)17 (27 May 2016)
75.	DotMusic Reconsideration Request 16-7 (30 May 2016)
76.	Letter from Arif Ali to Mr. Göran Marby regarding the ICANN Ombudsman Report (25 August 2016)

	Description
77.	Letter from DotMusic Limited to ICANN regarding DotMusic Limited's Notice Invoking the Cooperative Engagement Process (14 September 2016)
78.	DotMusic Presentation to ICANN Board Governance Committee (17 September 2016)
79.	DotMusic's Additional Responses to Question by BGC during presentation of 17 September 2016 (19 September 2016)
80.	Letter from Arif Ali to John Jeffrey and Amy Stathos regarding IRP related to Reconsideration Request 16-7 and resolution of Reconsideration Request 16-5 (10 November 2016)
81.	Letter from DotMusic Limited to Chairman Disspain and members of the BGC regarding DotMusic Limited's Reconsideration Request 16-5: .MUSIC's Economic Implications and Effects on the Music Community's Business Model and Global Public Interest (6 December 2016)
82.	Letter from Arif Ali to Chairman Disspain and members of the BGC regarding DotMusic Limited's Reconsideration Request 16-5: the Council of Europe Report DGI (2016)17 (15 December 2016)
83.	ICANN Webinar on Community gTLD Applications and Human Rights moderated by Terri Agnew (18 January 2017)
84.	Letter from Arif Ali to President Göran Marby and members of the BGC regarding BGC delay of recommendation with regard to Reconsideration Request 16-5 (30 January 2017) REDACTED
85.	Letter from Arif Ali to President Göran Marby and members of the BGC regarding BGC delay of recommendation with regard to Reconsideration Request 16-5 (30 January 2017) UNREDACTED
86.	Letter from ICANN regarding Update on the Review of the new gTLD Community Priority Evaluation Process (26 April 2017)

	Description
87.	Letter from Arif Ali to President Marby and Members of the Board re Dot Music Reconsideration Request concerning .MUSIC (28 April 2017)
88.	Documentary Information Disclosure Policy Request by Arif Ali on behalf of DotMusic Limited (5 May 2017)
89.	Letter from Jeffrey A. Levee to Arif Ali regarding status update on Reconsideration Request 16-5 (15 May 2017)
90.	Letter from Arif Ali to Jeffrey A. Levee regarding ICANN 15 May 2017 Letter Concerning DotMusic (21 May 2017)

Annex B **dotgay LLC**

Key Documents

Tab	Description
1.	Chris LaHatte, former ICANN Ombudsman, Dot Gay Report (27 July 2016)
2.	Expert Opinion of Prof. William N. Eskridge, Jr. (13 September 2016)
3.	Expert Opinion of Prof. M.V. Lee Badgett (17 October 2016)
4.	Council of Europe, “Applications to ICANN for Community-Based New Generic Top Level Domains (gTLDs): Opportunities and challenges from a human rights perspective” (3 November 2016)

Other Relevant Documents

Tab	Description
1.	Letter from Centrelink to ICANN Board regarding support of ICANN’s consideration to create the proposed .gay top-level-domain (TLD) (24 March 2011)
2.	Letter from Jamie Baxter to ICANN (10 October 2013)
3.	Letter from Centrelink to ICANN regarding support of ICANN’s consideration to create the proposed .gay top-level-domain (TLD) under the community model submitted by dotgay LLC (7 March 2014)
4.	Letter from David Gudelunas to ICANN and the EIU Evaluators (30 April 2014)

Tab	Description
5.	Letter from Scott Seitz to ICANN regarding Background on Community gTLDs (5 May 2014)
6.	Letter from Scott Seitz to ICANN regarding Shared Concerns of the Gay Community (5 May 2014)
7.	Letter from Jamie Baxter to ICANN regarding Supporting Evidence (5 May 2014)
8.	Letter from Jamie Baxter to ICANN regarding Additional Endorsements (5 May 2014)
9.	Letter from Jamie Baxter to ICANN regarding Updated Endorsements (5 May 2014)
10.	Letter from Jamie Baxter to ICANN (7 May 2014)
11.	Letter from Jamie Baxter to ICANN (27 May 2014)
12.	Original Request 14-44, along with Annexes (22 October 2014)
13.	Letter from International Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Trans and Intersex Association (ILGA) (17 November 2014)
14.	Letter from National Gay & Lesbian Chamber of Commerce (NGLCC) (17 November 2014)
15.	Letter from Federation of Gay Games to ICANN and Board Governance Committee (28 November 2014)
16.	Revised Request 14-44 (29 November 2014) • Annexes (29 November 2014)
17.	Letter from David Gudelunas to ICANN and Board Governance Committee (15 December 2014)

Tab	Description
18.	Letter from International Gay & Lesbian Travel Association (IGLTA) to ICANN and Board Governance Committee (18 December 2014)
19.	Letter from COC Nederland to ICANN and Board Governance Committee (14 January 2015)
20.	Letter from Durban Gay & Lesbian Film Festival (DGLFF) to ICANN and Board Governance Committee (15 January 2015)
21.	Letter from KwaZulu-Natal Gay and Lesbian Tourism Association (KZNGALTA) to ICANN and Board Governance Committee (18 January 2015)
22.	Letter from Gay Business Association (GBA) to ICANN and Board Governance Committee (18 January 2015)
23.	BGC Determination on Reconsideration Request 14-44 (20 January 2015)
24.	Letter from Kelley Daniel Mukwano to ICANN And the EIU (1 February 2015)
25.	Letter from Anne Stockwell to ICANN and the EIU (1 February 2015)
26.	Letter from Top Level Design, LLC, United TLD Holdco Ltd., and Top Level Domain Holdings, Ltd. to ICANN Board Governance Committee (3 February 2015)
27.	Letter from Peter Prokopik to ICANN and the EIU (5 February 2015)
28.	Letter from Jamie Baxter to ICANN regarding Update on Expressed Opposition to dotgay LLC (5 February 2015)
29.	Letter from Jamie Baxter to ICANN regarding Comments for CPE Panel (5 February 2015)
30.	Letter from Jamie Baxter to ICANN regarding Contention Set Recognition of Nexus between GAY and LGBTQIA (5 February 2015)

Tab	Description
31.	Letter from Jamie Baxter to ICANN regarding Expert Opinion on GAY Community .GAY (5 February 2015)
32.	Letter from Jamie Baxter to ICANN regarding Clarifications for CPE Panel (5 February 2015)
33.	Letter from Jamie Baxter to ICANN (6 February 2015)
34.	Letter from Jamie Baxter to ICANN (14 April 2015)
35.	Letter from Jamie Baxter to ICANN (29 May 2015)
36.	Letter from Jamie Baxter to ICANN (22 June 2015)
37.	Letter from Jamie Baxter to ICANN (23 June 2015)
38.	Letter from Jamie Baxter to ICANN (24 June 2015)
39.	Letter from Jamie Baxter to ICANN (29 June 2015)
40.	Letter from Jamie Baxter to ICANN (18 August 2015)
41.	Letter from Jamie Baxter to ICANN (3 September 2015)
42.	Reconsideration Request 15-21 (22 October 2015)
43.	Letter from dotgay LLC to Board Governance Committee (28 October 2015)
44.	Letter from UN-GLOBE to ICANN and the Board Governance Committee (12 January 2016)

Tab	Description
45.	Letter from dotgay LLC to ICANN and the Board Governance Committee (13 January 2016)
46.	Board Governance Committee Determination on Reconsideration Request 15-21 (1 February 2016)
47.	Letter from Jay Boucher to Akram Atallah and Chris Disspain (3 February 2016)
48.	Reconsideration Request 16-3 (17 February 2016)
49.	Letter from Transgender Equality Uganda to ICANN Board Governance committee regarding outcome of community scoring evaluation (24 February 2016)
50.	Letter from Trans-Fuzja to ICANN and Board Governance Committee regarding concerns about dotgay application (6 March 2016)
51.	Dotgay's Presentation to the Board Governance Committee (15 May 2016)
52.	DotGay's Written Summary of Its Oral Presentation to the BGC (17 May 2016)
53.	DotGay's Written Summary of Renato Sabbadini's Statement to the BGC (17 May 2016)
54.	"Applications to ICANN for Community-Based New Generic Top Level Domains (gTLDs): Opportunities and challenges from a human rights perspective" Council of Europe report DGI(2016)17 (27 May 2016)
55.	Letter from dotgay LLC to ICANN and Board Governance Committee Re: Reconsideration Request 16-3 (24 June 2016)
56.	Board Governance Committee Recommendation on Reconsideration Request 16-3 (26 June 2016)
57.	Letter from Renato Sabbadini to the ICANN Board (8 August 2016)

Tab	Description
58.	Letter from Michael Bach to the ICANN Board (8 August 2016)
59.	Letter from Michael Rogers to the ICANN Board (16 August 2016)
60.	Letter from Dechert LLP on behalf of dotgay LLC to ICANN President & CEO Göran Marby (25 August 2016)
61.	Letter from Scott Seitz to Steve Crocker regarding Letter from United TLD Holdco Ltd., Top Level Domain Holdings, Ltd., and Top Level Design, LLC to ICANN dated August 24, 2016 (8 September 2016)
62.	Letter from Dechert LLP on behalf of dotgay LLC to ICANN Board, enclosing expert opinion of Prof. William N. Eskridge, Jr. (13 September 2016)
63.	Letter from Statton Hammock to the ICANN Board (12 October 2016)
64.	Letter from Arif Ali to Chairman Crocker and Members of the ICANN Board regarding Expert Opinion of Prof. M.V. Lee Badgett, in Support of dotgay's Community Priority Application No: 1-1713-23699 (17 October 2016)
65.	Letter from Arif Ali to Chairman Crocker and Board of Directors re: Council of Europe Report DGI(2016) 17 - .GAY TLD (15 November 2016)
66.	ICANN Webinar moderated by Terri Agnew (18 January 2017)
67.	Letter from Arif Ali to President Marby and BGC regarding ICANN Board's failure to issue its final decision on the Board Governance Committee's Recommendation on Reconsideration Request 16-3 (30 January 2017)
68.	Letter from LGBT Denmark to ICANN Board Members regarding support to correct discriminatory treatment of .GAY (14 February 2017)
69.	Letter from Mario Paez to the ICANN Board (8 March 2017)

Tab	Description
70.	Letter from Arif Ali to President Marby and Members of the Board regarding inquiry about final decision on 26 June 2016 recommendation (12 March 2017)
71.	Email from Jamie Baxter to Steve Crocker regarding the Blog Post on the CPE Investigation (17 April 2017)
72.	Letter from Chris Disspain regarding update on the review of the new gTLD CPE process (26 April 2017)
73.	Letter from Jeffrey Levee to Arif Ali regarding Application of dotgay LLC (15 May 2017)
74.	Letter from Christine Willett to Scott Seitz and Jamie Baxter regarding Reconsideration Request 16-3 (16 May 2017)
75.	Documentary Information Disclosure Policy Request by Arif Ali on behalf of dotgay (18 May 2017)